A new neighbourhood dynamic for Grimsby’s East Marsh

An integrated impact assessment

Geoff Green · Bernard Stafford · Paul Pugh
A new neighbourhood dynamic for Grimsby’s East Marsh

Foreword
Acknowledgements
Executive summary
Introduction
Methodology
Neighbourhood profile
Housing
Economy
Education
Environment
Health
Security
Summary
Foreword

The Local Strategic Partnership works on the principle that better results can be achieved for our community when public, private and third sector organisations work together, supporting and challenging each other and recognising that the challenges we face are all interlinked.

By tackling worklessness we can have a very real impact on crime and, by working together to improve decent housing we have an impact on the health of many people in our community. Fighting the causes of poor health can have a dramatic impact on the education achievements of our young people.

This Integrated Impact Assessment for East Marsh provides a great deal of clear evidence and gives us invaluable information to guide where our public bodies can direct their resources and achieve the most positive impact for the people they serve. Making sure public money is used efficiently has never been more in focus and this assessment gives us the opportunity to do just that.

I am also delighted that North East Lincolnshire is leading the UK on Integrated Area Assessments.

Mark Webb
Chair of North East Lincolnshire Local Strategic Partnership

Authors of this report

Professor Geoff Green
Centre for Regional Economic and Social Research
Sheffield Hallam University

Dr. Bernard Stafford
York Research Partnership - Economics Department
University of York

Designer of this report

Paul Pugh
ppdesign

Cover photograph © Thomas Ley
This study was inspired by Cynthia Manson-Siddle. Now Deputy Director of Public Health in North East Lincolnshire, she pioneered Integrated Impact Assessment within the Yorkshire and Humber Region and has promoted this protocol in North East Lincolnshire (NEL). Madeline Bell, Deputy Director of Strategic Housing then seized the opportunity to apply IIA to the East Marsh Neighbourhood Renewal Area in Grimsby. Commissioned jointly by North East Lincolnshire Council (NELC) and the local NHS Care Trust Plus, the report itself is a collective effort, administratively supported by Margaret Higgins and Lynne Mallinson and drawing on the expertise of many officials. Steering group members included Lisa King, Urban Regeneration and Renaissance Manager and Tony Neul, Environmental Policy Manager (both NELC) Andy Goudie, Executive Director of the Grimsby Institute and Inspector Terry Ward from Humberside Police.

Claire Wollington, Regeneration Officer for Shoreline Housing Partnership and Yvonne Lowe, Director of Operations for Havelock Homes, contributed their great knowledge and expertise both on the condition of the social housing stock and on wider regeneration issues. Philip Thames and Lucy Hudson, Shoreline Neighbourhood Investment Managers, supplied housing data and insights on security and safety issues. Jacqui Wells, Housing Renewal Manager with NELC, provided an overview of the private housing sector and the various enforcement measures against slum landlords.

Martin Bayes, Chief Executive of Grimsby Fish Market and Councillor Steve Norton, Chief Executive of Grimsby Fish Merchants Association, gave an overview of the local economy, and in particular, prospects for the Grimsby Fish Dock Area abutting East Marsh. Liz Hutchinson and David Tinsley provided information on Job Centre Plus and Colin Bulger, NELC Assistant Chief Executive, supplied key documents and insights on economic regeneration. Annie Derby, OBE, highlighted the intermediate labour market promoted by the NHS and Dr. David Usher from Leeds Metropolitan University provided a strategic context for regional economic development.

Anita Havercroft, Performance Information Analyst with NELC Childrens Services, interpreted official schools attainment and achievement statistics; Angela Tunstall, Team Leader for School Admissions, confirmed catchment areas for local schools and Stuart Powell provided insights into the Contextual Added Value of schools and introduced Prof. David Jesson of York University to provide his expertise. Information on Healthy Schools was provided by Matt Sinclair, Director of Co-Curriculum at Havelock Academy. Thanks also to Heather Hawkes, Head of Weelsby Primary School, for confirmation of school attainment.

Cynthia Manson-Siddle opened many doors in the NHS Care Trust Plus. Danny O’Toole, Programme Coordinator for the Specialist Health Promotion Service, provided local data on coronary heart disease and scientific evidence on disease prevention. Jeremy Baskett, Assistant Director of Community Involvement and Engagement, provided information on Older Peoples Collaboratives, to promote health and prevent disease in East Marsh.

Spencer Hunt, Safer Communities Service Manager provided key documents and great insights into crime and crime reduction in NEL and opened doors to Humberside Police. Beyond the call of duty, Inspector Ed Cook, Intelligence Manager for A Division shared crime data and a thoughtful overview of causes and remedies for this key challenge in East Marsh. He commissioned a special set of data for the East Marsh NRA and a succinct report was provided by Intelligence Analyst, Louise Thickett. Insights into the wider determinants of crime were provided by John Willis, Neighbourhood Community Safety Officer with Humberside Police, Penny Humphries, NELC’s Street Warden Manager and John Ellis OBE, Shalom Youth Centre Manager. Sue Pearson, NEL’s Environmental Management Officer, highlighted the security aspects of her improvements to Grant Thorold Park.

Thanks also to the CRESR data team led by Christina Beatty. Research Associates Mike Foden and Ian Wilson supplied official economic and social data and assisted greatly interpreting the results of the East Marsh Community Survey. Administrators Emma Smith and Sarah Ward inputted this data from resident questionnaires and obtained data on property from the Land Registry. Paul Truin and INTERVIEW led by Kaye Bruce, obtained an exceptionally high response rate from the resident survey. Izabella Jagiello and Lisa Atkinson, Senior Business Development Managers with Experian, secured permission for the Mosaic images. Finally we worked with designer Paul Pugh to make the report as accessible as possible to a wider audience. As joint authors of the study we take responsibility for any errors or omissions.

Geoff Green  Professor of Urban Policy, Centre for Regional and Economic Research, Sheffield Hallam University.

Dr Bernard Stafford  Director of the York Research Partnership, Depart of Economics, University of York.

August 2009
Executive summary

Recommendation 1

Integrated Impact Assessment pioneered in North East Lincolnshire should lead to a holistic approach to sustainable regeneration of the East Marsh Neighbourhood Renewal Area.

Key messages below summarise our assessment of 6 domains of life in East Marsh. We highlight how investment in each domain impacts on the others. We recommend that the impressive NEL partnerships utilise this evidence in order to enhance the initial building’s-led approach to NRA regeneration.

Recommendation 2

Designation of a Neighbourhood Renewal Area creates an opportunity for optimising investment to enhance the lives of East Marsh residents.

On nearly every dimension of life, the East Marsh neighbourhood is on a downward trajectory. Many partner agencies are working together to reverse the decline. In an era of budget restrictions, targeted investment in security measures, environmental improvements and “soft” labour market skills are likely to have most impact in the short term.

Key messages

Housing
- An increasing proportion of the terraced housing stock in East Marsh is privately rented and in poor condition
- Investing in measures to improve the warmth, safety and security of the housing stock in East Marsh will improve the health and well-being of residents

Economy
- Unemployment in parts of East Marsh ranks almost the worst in England
- Evidence endorses the NEL Economic Well-Being Strategy of targeting a combination of health promotion and interventions to improve labour market matching

Education
- High levels of deprivation in East Marsh help explain below average performance of local schools
- Sure Start and the Healthy Schools programme promote health and life skills, aiming to improve social and economic well-being in adults

Environment
- Past programmes and future plans for East Marsh recognise that investment in the environment has a significant impact on the housing market, residents’ security and their health

Health
- Care Trust Plus, an innovative partnership between the Council and NHS, is well positioned to improve lifestyles and the wider determinants of health
- Interventions to improve health early in the course of life are cost-effective in enhancing economic performance and reducing dependency in later life

Security
- East Marsh NRA has persistently high levels of crime and disorder which damage the health and well-being of residents
- Working through the Community Safety Partnership, Humberside Police have pinpointed the pattern of crime and have a lead role in improving safety and security
Strategic context

Commissioned jointly by North East Lincolnshire Council and the Care Trust Plus, this Integrated Impact Assessment (IIA) is aligned with strategies designed to promote sustainable development in Grimsby. The Local Strategic Partnership (LSP) places such a high value on sustainability that a third of ‘Shaping the Future’ — its key community strategy — is devoted to a framework for appraising how public and private investment will achieve this aim.

Community assets

Sustainability is about more than the global environment highlighted by the Rio Earth Summit organised by the United Nations in 1992. The LSP Strategy is designed to integrate social, environmental and economic development, principally in the whole of NE Lincolnshire but also in neighbourhoods. We adopt an ‘asset & flow’ model derived from the World Bank (figure 1), of how to sustain neighbourhood well-being by enhancing community assets — environmental, social and economic.

Baseline research

Our report focuses on the renewal area of East Marsh. An intersectoral steering group has guided the work. The research team (from the Centre for Regional Economic and Social Research and the Economics Department at the University of York) has built up a baseline picture of East Marsh, with a special focus on the dynamic impact of housing on the health of residents. Evidence is drawn from a new residents’ survey (and the survey by consultants cpc), official statistics and intelligence from professionals and managers working hard for the future of East Marsh.

Integrated Impact Assessment

The second component of the research is the appraisal stage of an integrated impact assessment of policies, services and programmes designed to ensure East Marsh has a sustainable future. In 2008 a team of professionals used the IIA appraisal tool to undertake an initial scoping. We have worked with them on a full appraisal.

Six key domains (figure 2) were selected by the steering group from the 15 covered by the tool. Our approach is ‘dynamic’ appraisal or accounting. Whereas in the past, departments and agencies may have operated in silos, with narrow targets and ring fenced budgets, now they take a wider perspective. Our objective is to assess the wider impact of investments or programmes. Though housing investment will have a major impact on housing incomes, there should be a positive impact on health, economic development, the environment and security.

Key message: This Integrated Impact Assessment further develops the sustainability tool promoted by the Local Strategic Partnership of North East Lincolnshire

Introduction

A new neighbourhood dynamic for Grimsby’s East Marsh

Figure 1

Figure 2

Grimsby’s famous Dock Tower symbolises the declining fortunes of the East Marsh neighbourhood. Built in the 19th century at the north eastern tip of what is now East Marsh Ward, the tower serviced the biggest fishing port in Europe. Now with the decline of the fish catching industry, both tower and neighbourhood are largely dysfunctional to the town’s new economy.

**Neighbourhood focus**

The focus of our study is the grid iron of terraced property highlighted on the map of East Marsh in pink and bounded in red. The streets now contain 3962 of the 5440 dwellings in East Marsh Ward and an estimated 75% of the population. These traditional terraces contain probably the poorest dwellings and most deprived community in Grimsby.

**Plans and strategies**

Shoreline Housing Partnership has pioneered investment plans for East Marsh. As a new registered social landlord since 2005, it has been responsible for the majority of dwellings which replaced the meanest terraces in the council’s post-war slum clearance programme. Its Neighbourhood Investment Plan (2004) for the high rise properties which dominate the western skyline of East Marsh was followed by a Neighbourhood Investment Plan for a wider area (2007) and then in 2008 by a Neighbourhood Investment Plan for the new Humber Neighbourhood which extends beyond East Marsh Ward.¹

**Neighbourhood Renewal Area**

Since publication of The Joint Housing strategy for North East and North Lincolnshire,² North East Lincolnshire Council (NELC) has assumed greater responsibility for an intersectoral approach to the revitalisation of the neighbourhood of traditional terraced houses. An intensive process of fact-finding property surveys by Capital Project Consultancy Ltd (CPC)³ and neighbourhood consultation with residents built up to the declaration of a Neighbourhood Renewal Area in 2008. A March 2008 NELC Cabinet report set out a strategy and action plan. £8 million of public funds is allocated for the clearance of 100 properties in Guildford Street and the regeneration of the whole area, including £210k for environmental improvements and £90k for security measures.

The intersectoral steering group for the East Marsh Project — called Project Team — Fresh Start East Marsh — is responsible for developing and implementing the action plan. Residents can influence spending priorities via East Marsh Involve.

---

Methodology

Key message: Data from four different sources is ‘triangulated’ to build up a comprehensive picture of East Marsh Neighbourhood Renewal Area

Methodology is the science of method, linking how we collect data with our concept of how a neighbourhood works. Our hypothesis is developed via the two related models shown in the introduction – for sustainable community development and Integrated Impact Assessment of six domains of community life. Then we used four methods to collect and analyse data.

Official National Statistics

Some locally relevant data — for example on school performance and the labour market — are obtained from national data sources such as the Department of Children, Schools and Families, NOMIS and the Land Registry. The Office of National Statistics (ONS) provides local data on deprivation. We show in our introductory neighbourhood profile how their indices of multiple deprivation (IMD) match the six key domains identified by the project steering group. Policy-makers in North East Lincolnshire are familiar with the IMD because of the headline crime statistic showing a part of East Marsh as worst in England. We have collected data on all six domains for each of the seven sub-areas (‘Super-Output Areas’ in official jargon) which broadly constitute the Neighbourhood Renewal Area of 4000 residential properties.

Scientific evidence

At the beginning of each of the sections covering each domain we highlight the pathways from investment to impact. We do not have to conduct more surveys to establish these links. Our method is to ‘plug-in’ evidence from expert reports and peer-reviewed scientific studies. For example it is already proven that exercise reduces the risk of coronary heart disease and there is evidence that investment to make parks and spaces secure and user-friendly will encourage more residents to take exercise as part of their everyday lives.

Resident survey

We conducted an additional survey of a representative sample of 223 residents in late 2008/early 2009, for three reasons. First we wished to compare status, opinion and attitudes (such as fear of crime) with national benchmarks. Second, we expose links between different aspects of resident’s lives (such as health and fear of crime). By interviewing a sample of household members in the properties surveyed by CPC we can estimate the impact of poor housing conditions. Third, these baseline results will be compared with those from a follow-through survey after the NRA has delivered improvements.

Local data

Addresses and postcodes of residential property in the NRA were provided by Strategic Housing and Safer Communities, part of the Community Care Directorate. Some locally relevant data — for example on school performance and the labour market — are obtained from national data sources such as ONS, NOMIS and the Land Registry. For housing this is supplemented by the local stock condition survey of 420 representative properties (of 3962 in the NRA) undertaken by CPC in 2007. The NHS Care Trust Plus supplied local data on illness and death, from coronary heart disease for example. The Grimsby Division of Humberside Police extracted crime statistics from its Joint Strategic Intelligence Assessment. All these facts and figures were related to policy and strategy documents supplied by NELC and partners.

We were careful both to (i) secure a representative sample of residents and (ii) give greater weight to households in properties likely to benefit most from NRA improvements. We targeted 301 of the 420 dwellings surveyed by CPC, including 180 (61.5%) non-decent and 121 (38.5%) randomly selected decent dwellings. Our interviewers recorded 20 vacant properties; were refused interviews by 4 households and secured completed questionnaires from one adult member of 223 households; a response rate of 79.4% of occupied properties. Respondents split 49.3% male and 50.7% female and were drawn from 36 streets containing 92% of all households, with more interviews in populous streets. Results were adjusted to account for any differences between respondents from decent compared with non-decent properties, though these tended not to be significant.
Neighbourhood profile

**Key message 1:** Official statistics reveal East Marsh is one of the most deprived neighbourhoods in the whole of England

**Key message 2:** Relative to the rest of England, East Marsh is becoming more deprived, mainly because of crime

East Marsh has the worst crime record in England. So run newspaper headlines. More precisely, government statistics reveal that of 32,832 sub-areas constituting the whole nation, a group of streets in the Neighbourhood Renewal Area (NRA) was number one for crime ‘deprivation’ in 2007.

**Geometry of deprivation**

Government statistics provide an insight into the wider dynamic of East Marsh — recent trends and comparison with the rest of England. The six domains chosen for our impact assessment are closely matched by the components of the UK government’s Index of Multiple Deprivation (IMD). ²

The seven components of the IMD are shown as points on the ‘spider’ figure 3. Income and employment match our economic domain; crime matches security; education and health are the same. The living environment covers two of our domains, both the indoor (housing) and outdoor environment. Barriers to Housing and Services are defined by access, both financial and distance to schools and supermarkets. ³

For easy illustration, figure 3 compares the pattern of deprivation between just four of the seven sub-areas of the NRA. Sub-area components closest to the centre have higher deprivation scores. ⁴

**Relative deprivation**

How does East Marsh compare with the rest of England? The headline is that all of the NRA’s seven sub-areas each containing a few streets — are among the worst in the country; that is high or very high on the composite IMD. There is a gradient running from the highly deprived north to the slightly less deprived south.

The sub-areas in (i) the North West of the NRA, centred on Guildford Street (ii) North and (iii) North East ranked respectively 59, 61 and 111 putting them in the most deprived 1% of sub-areas nationally.

Three sub-areas in the Mid, South West and the South East of the NRA were ranked between 1387 and 3067, putting them within the most deprived 10%. The least deprived sub-area to the South, centred on Wheelsby Street South is ranked 6406, and within the most deprived 20% areas nationally.

Only on access to housing and services do all the sub-areas perform well (ranked between 29,000 and 31,000 on the deprivation index). This reflects very low house prices — averaging less than £45,000 in Guildford Street at the height of the property boom in 2007 — and proximity to doctor’s surgeries and the Freeman Street shopping centre. There is debate about whether these are really indicators of deprivation as commonly understood.

---

¹ The Government Office of National Statistics has divided the country into a mosaic of 32,842 Lower Layer Super Output Areas (LLS0As). Seven of these cover the Neighbourhood Renewal Area — four entirely within the boundary and three straddling the northern and western boundary with the ‘High Rise’ Neighbourhood of predominantly social housing.


³ A technical guide to the IMD components and ranking protocols is also provided in our East Marsh NRA Study Working Paper 2; Unpacking the ONS Index of Multiple Deprivation.

⁴ On a logarithmic scale.
Neighbourhood profile

Social housing sub-division

Official IMD statistics and the commercial Mosaic typology developed by Experian, help us to identify two distinct sub-areas of East Marsh. First are the small social housing estates which predominate in the north and north west of the NRA. Here the living environment dimension of the IMD — both indoors and outdoors — is relatively good as shown in the spider figure on the previous page. However, tenants rank poorly on the two elements of human capital — health and education — which in turn, are highly correlated with high unemployment and low incomes. The Mosaic typology characterises households here as ‘families on benefits’ or with ‘low horizons.’

Private housing sub-division

Second, is the grid iron of streets in the middle, southern and south eastern parts of the NRA, lined with terraced housing occupied by private tenants or owners. In the middle section front doors open directly onto the street; in the slightly more prosperous southern section houses have small front gardens. Mosaic characterises both as ‘Coronation Street’ and their generic image (figure 4) accurately reflects the predominant street scene in East Marsh. The IMD shows a relatively poor living environment.

Trends

All seven sub-areas became relatively more deprived between 2004 and 2007 as shown in figure 5. For example, the northern sub-area ranked 158th most deprived in England in 2004 and 61st in 2007.

The least deprived south sub-area ranked 6602 in 2004 and 6406 in 2007.

Much of this deterioration is attributable to a relative increase in crime. The North West sub-area centred on Guildford Street was ranked 59 for crime in 2004 and first in 2007, the worst in the UK. The least deprived sub-area ranked 5795 for crime in 2004 and 1679 in 2007 — a dramatic deterioration of over 4000 rank places.
Housing

Key message 1: An increasing proportion of the terraced housing stock in East Marsh is privately rented and in poor condition

Key message 2: Investing in measures to improve the warmth, safety and security of the housing stock in East Marsh will improve the health and well-being of residents

Investment paradox

Though housing investment in East Marsh has a major impact on many aspects of residents’ lives (figure 6) the type of investment is crucial. It is essential to distinguish investment in house purchase from investment in improving housing quality. The paradox of Guildford Street highlights the difference. Between the years 2000 and 2007 average selling prices more than tripled from £14,000 to £44,000. Yet such is the deterioration in the physical fabric of these houses — and the decline in their utility value to occupiers — that most are now scheduled for demolition.

Housing market impacts

Drawing on the rationale of Housing Market Renewal Pathfinders in nine other depressed areas of England, the Neighbourhood Renewal Area in East Marsh aims for a successful housing market which improves both housing quality and residents’ well-being. Scottish evidence shows that a financially secure home base gives occupiers control over their environment and provides a haven in an uncertain world. Canadian evidence reveals health, especially mental health, results from housing as a ‘good location for life,’ free of the strain of high housing costs and worries about being forced to move.

The downside of an unsuccessful housing market is depression and anxiety caused by financial stress. The credit crunch will exacerbate a problem already widespread for marginal or sub-prime owner-occupiers. Evidence from an earlier period of stress in the UK housing market highlights the psychological distress of mortgage arrears and repossession.

After the death of her husband, Mrs Z moved to East Marsh, ‘for a cheap property near the sea.’ She paid £45,000 for a builder who had bought it for £20,000 a month earlier. He had done it up but it is still damp and the windows do not fit properly. Mrs Z cannot afford these repairs because she works part time on a minimum wage. She reduced her hours because of anxiety and depression caused by the uncertain future of East Marsh and problems of security (now remedied) in the alleyway behind her terrace.

Housing quality impacts

Cold, unsafe and insecure homes undermine resident’s confidence to engage with the labour market and wider society. Route one is poor health. Cold homes contribute to long term illness and excess of winter deaths, primarily because of cardiovascular disease in older people. Children suffer most from respiratory disease caused by damp homes, compromising their education.

The government’s 2001 National Service Framework for Older People cites falls as a major cause of disability and death in older people. The British Crime Survey reveals over 80% of victims are emotionally affected by burglary — 20% suffering from anxiety and depression. In East Marsh high burglary rates probably account for the high proportion of residents on Incapacity Benefits because of mental health problems.

Figure 6: Housing investment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Environment</th>
<th>Health</th>
<th>Housing</th>
<th>Security</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Economy</td>
<td>Environment</td>
<td>Health</td>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>Security</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Source: Land Registry.
**Investment in quality**

There have been six waves of investment in the bricks and mortar of 4000 homes in the East Marsh NRA shown on map 2. Originally built (i) in the late 19th Century, the worst properties to the north were replaced by modern council homes (ii) between 1957 and 1980. Original terraced houses were upgraded (iii) via a programme of Housing Action Areas between 1975 and 1990, often with the help of council grants. Commercial developers built (iv) a small number houses for sale in the 1970’s.

New social housing was built (v) from 1980, predominantly by Havelok Housing Association which has 470 properties in the NRA following completion of their Roberts Street development of 39 homes for an investment of £4.1 million. Finally having taken over all the council owned stock in 2005, Shoreline Housing Association is comprehensively upgrading (vi) their properties via the government funded Decent Homes Programme.

**Market investment**

The dominant area of housing (shown in light orange) is a mix of private rented and owner-occupied terraced houses. Here the investment is primarily for house purchase rather than improvement. There has been some upgrading of better property in the southern third sector of the NRA (predominantly owner-occupied). There are relatively few improvements undertaken by private landlords who predominate in the middle and northern sectors unless these are enforced by the council.
Our estimates for potential health improvement in the following pages utilise an extensive property survey commissioned by NEL council in 2007 as a prelude to declaring a Neighbourhood Renewal Area. CPC Ltd fully surveyed a representative sample of 1 in 10 of 3965 dwellings. Over 70% were pre 1919 terraces located as on our map.

**Non-decent homes**

Using government guidelines their surveyors calculated that 1700 properties — 42.9% of the stock — were “Non Decent according to four broad criteria that the property should be:

- free of Category 1 Hazards
- be in a reasonabe state of repair
- have reasonably modern facilities (such as kitchens and bathrooms) and services
- provide a reasonable degree of thermal comfort (effective insulation and efficient heating)

The biggest cause of failure (64%) to meet the Decent Homes Standard was a poor degree of thermal comfort (figure 8) followed by failures (37%) attributable to category 1 Hazards. These are part of the Housing Health and Safety Rating System codified by the 2004 Housing Act and incorporated into our methodology for estimating health impacts.

**Tenure**

The tenure pattern of East Marsh appears to be changing. The CPC survey revealed a split of 47% of dwellings owner-occupied, 22% privately rented and 31% managed by Housing Associations (Registered Social Landlords). Our own East Marsh Community Survey of residents was drawn from a sub-sample of CPC’s surveyed property. Adjusting for the oversampling of occupants of non-decent property, our survey indicates that 44% of dwellings are privately rented and only half of these are decent. (figure 9)

In their national review of the private rented sector commissioned by the government, Julie Rugg and David Rhodes identify a range of niche markets including “slum landlordism.” The label may apply to the small scale local landlords who, the Land Registry reveals, predominate in the NRA. Our survey reveals only 3% of privately rented dwellings are owned by property companies. Only 18% of individual owners live outside Lincolnshire. The majority live in North East Lincolnshire or less than 30 miles away.

Jaqui Wells, housing renewal manager for NELC and her enforcement colleagues also identify the private rented sector as a focus for special measures. A new Landlord Accreditation may help provide a comprehensive solution to poor property conditions. If it does not then Selective Licensing may be the answer to resolving the investment paradox summarised at the beginning of this section.

---

Energy efficiency and tackling fuel poverty are key objectives for housing investment in the East Marsh Neighbourhood Renewal Area. Because the 2007 house condition survey by cpc shows energy efficiency levels way below the English average, there is considerable scope for improvement.

The new property owned by Housing Associations is energy efficient and the Decent Homes Programme will bring Shoreline’s portfolio of ex-council housing up to standard. So the spotlight is on the stock of old private sector terraced housing, both owner-occupied and privately rented. Poor thermal comfort accounted for 64% of properties designated as non-decent by the cpc surveyors.

Health Impact

Our literature review highlights compelling evidence of a strong link between cold homes and poor health, warm homes and good health (figure 10). Every year in the UK up to 50,000 more people die in the winter compared with the summer months. We estimate that up to six of these originate in the NRA.

The Operating Guidance reports that a healthy indoor temperature is 21°C and ‘a small health risk of adverse health effects begins once the temperature falls below 19°C. Serious health risks occur below 16°C with a substantially increased risk of respiratory disease and cardiovascular disease.’ Cold conditions affect older people especially, linked cardiovascular disease and death. Children are more likely to suffer from respiratory problems associated with damp conditions brought about by the condensation caused by low temperatures.

Reducing risk

Figure 11 estimates the impact on health of investing in high levels of energy efficiency to eliminate cold conditions in the NRA stock of 3962 dwellings. The baseline is adapted from table 2.02 of the HHSRS which estimates a one in 330 pre-1919 dwellings where an occupant is likely to suffer harm and seek medical attention. Over 70% of NRA dwellings are in this category. Though new buildings generally have a lower risk, cpc surveys indicate this is not the case in East Marsh. We estimate a baseline risk of 1 in 300 to reflect poorer than average thermal comfort scores for every type and age of property.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health Impact</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Our literature review highlights compelling evidence of a strong link between cold homes and poor health, warm homes and good health (figure 10). Every year in the UK up to 50,000 more people die in the winter compared with the summer months. We estimate that up to six of these originate in the NRA. The Operating Guidance reports that a healthy indoor temperature is 21°C and ‘a small health risk of adverse health effects begins once the temperature falls below 19°C. Serious health risks occur below 16°C with a substantially increased risk of respiratory disease and cardiovascular disease.’ Cold conditions affect older people especially, linked cardiovascular disease and death. Children are more likely to suffer from respiratory problems associated with damp conditions brought about by the condensation caused by low temperatures.


Impact on health

The impact on health of eliminating cold conditions is modest, as is our similar estimate for removing condensation damp. However the reduction in Class 1 harms to health may amount to preventing up to 5 winter deaths, probably advanced by a heart attack. Children are the main beneficiaries of eliminating damp conditions, with an estimated reduction of 15 suffering modest (Class IV) respiratory problems which require medical attention.
**Accidents**

By far the greatest number of accidents in the UK occurs in the home. Approximately 2.8 million a year warrant a visit to an accident and emergency department of the NHS. Inside the home, most accidents occur in the living/dining room followed by those in the kitchen.

Eleven of all the 29 hazards identified in the HHSRS lead to accidents. Falls are the biggest sub-group, causing nearly half of all home accidents. These relate to the design, construction and maintenance of the dwelling. Occupants of East Marsh’s nineteenth century terraces are more likely than average to suffer falls caused by uneven or slippery surfaces and electrical shocks, slips, burns and scolds caused by poorly designed kitchens and bathrooms.

**Reducing risk**

Figure 13 estimates the impact on health of housing improvements to reduce the risk of falls on the level in the NRA stock of 3962 dwellings. The baseline is adapted from table 20.02 of the HHSRS which estimates that in pre-1919 dwellings, hazards are likely to pose a one in 124 risk sufficiently serious for an occupant to suffer harm and seek medical attention. Over 70% of NRA dwellings are old terraces and, according to the CPC survey, generally in poorer condition than the English average. We therefore estimate a baseline risk of 1 in 100 within the probable range from 1 in 74 to 1 in 133. This affects between 30 and 54 East Marsh residents annually.

**Health Impact**

Older people would be the main beneficiaries of housing renewal which upgraded kitchens, bathrooms and windows. Published in 2001, the UK Government’s National Service Framework for Older People emphasised falls as a major cause of disability and the leading cause of mortality due to injury in older people aged over 75. Standard 6 aimed to ‘Reduce the number of falls which result in serious injury and ensure effective treatment and rehabilitation for those who have fallen.’ Primary Care Trusts and Local Authorities are required to work together on an Integrated Falls Strategy and an integrated service. Government advice emphasises person-centred prevention and care, though also acknowledging the wider housing context.

---

A new neighbourhood dynamic for Grimsby’s East Marsh

Freedom from crime and fear of crime is a priority for North East Lincolnshire, both at a strategic and community level. The challenge is enormous in East Marsh NRA, the hottest of all crime hotspots in the whole of England. Section 7 summarises the range of measures being implemented across many domains. Probably most effective are target hardening measures to reduce burglary in dwellings.

Security and health

The emotional impact of burglary is well documented by the British Crime Survey showing 83% of all respondents who were victims of burglary were emotionally affected in some way, with attempted burglary also having a significant affect.1 Additionally the HHSRS takes account of the harmful impact on victims’ neighbours who may experience a heightened sense of insecurity.

Security measures

There is considerable research evidence (of variable quality) to show that installing home security measures (within a variety of neighbourhood contexts) reduces the chances of burglary. The Home Office reports:

‘Households where there are no home security measures were far more likely to have been victims of burglary (14.7%) than those where there were simple security measures such as deadlocks on doors and window locks (2.8%).”

In a wide ranging review2 for the Suzy Lamplugh Trust Research Institute at the University of Glamorgan, Paul Cozens and others take a critical review of the evidence, distinguishing target hardening of properties from the design of housing estates. Another key evaluation of target hardening of properties owned by Glasgow Housing Association concludes that installing doors and windows to Secured by Design standards reduces burglaries by 75%.4

Potential health benefits

Our baseline of the likelihood of intruders causing harm to a resident of East Marsh is between 1 in 7 and 1 in 12. (figure 15). It is derived by adapting table 12.02 in the Operating Guidance for the Operating Guidance of the Housing Health and Safety Rating System5 to take account of local evidence on burglary rates. We estimate that up to 550 East Marsh residents currently suffer some form of emotional or mental health problem as a result of intruders, though often it is low level anxiety.

We estimate that full scale implementation of security measures based on Secured by Design principles will reduce the likelihood of harm to between 1 in 82 and 1 in 147. Our most optimistic estimate is a reduction of 470 residents harmed by intruders sufficient for them to seek medical attention. Of all the measures planned to improve the housing stock, target hardening to reduce burglary are likely to make the most widespread impact on health.
Key message 1: Unemployment in parts of East Marsh ranks almost the worst in England
Key message 2: Evidence endorses the NEL Economic Well-Being Strategy of targeting a combination of health promotion and interventions to improve labour market matching

A strong local economy is fundamental to the prosperity of East Marsh and impacts on many aspects of residents’ lives. The ‘spider’ diagrams in our introduction show close links between employment and income. These are highly correlated with education and health, the two essential elements of human capital or ‘fitness for work’.

Cause and effect flow both ways (figure 16). For example, in a vicious downward spiral, poor working conditions in a fish processing factory may cause health problems leading to unemployment. In a virtuous circle, good health leads to a better job and a good job promotes better health.

**Impact on local labour market**

East Marsh residents tend to work within a mile of where they live. Economists say they have a low ‘job search horizon.’ The 2001 Census provides the latest data and reveals nearly 90% of the 3760 employed residents in East Marsh ward worked in North East Lincolnshire, 73% within 3 miles of their home (compared with 40% nationally) and 35% within the ward boundaries (primarily in the Fish Dock area). A quarter worked as ‘process plant and machine operatives’ and a similar percentage in ‘elementary occupations.’

**Investment**

There are close ties between residents of East Marsh and Grimsby Fish Docks. In its heyday this community supplied labour for one of the biggest fishing fleets in Europe and port facilities. **Investment** in food processing partly offset a dramatic decline of the fishing industry after the ‘cod wars’ of the 1970’s. Now it is the dominant industry in the Fish Dock Area and helps tag Grimsby ‘Food Capital of the North’ or ‘Frozen Food Capital of Europe.’ Grimsby Fish Market is also the biggest in the UK, taking fresh fish stocks from other ports by road and from Iceland via Immingham docks.

**Labour market paradox**

There should be a match between the largely unskilled residents of East Marsh – as revealed by our survey – and many low skill jobs in the nearby Fish Dock area and adjacent wards. Yet nearly half those of working age do not have a formal job. This is reflected in the Indices of Multiple Deprivation. Around Hamilton Street employment is in the worst 1% (19th of 32,842) sub-areas in the whole of England and the Guildford Street sub-area ranks in the top 1% for unemployment benefits.

Figure 17 compares take-up of out-of-work benefits in East Marsh Ward with the national average. A stable 16% of the working age population remains on incapacity benefit. But as the recession bites, the number on job seekers benefit has increased from 610 in August 2008 to 805 in February 2009 – now 11.2% of the working population. Worklessness is a big challenge for both residents and policy-makers.

---

A new neighbourhood dynamic for Grimsby’s East Marsh Economy

Local labour market

A formal economic model (figure 18) helps explain the labour market paradox in East Marsh and highlights three points of intervention. First is creating more job opportunities. However, though failure to resolve the future of the Grimsby Fish Dock Area may have inhibited investment, there remains a demand for relatively unskilled labour. Second, on the labour supply side, our survey reveals both a group of residents too ill to work and an expanding low-skilled pool who are healthy enough to work. There is a case for long term investment in health promotion.

Third, most important, is labour market matching — the institutional processes (led by Job Centre Plus) and personal activities relating to job search which determine who works, who does not and which vacancies remain unfilled. National evidence suggests that as a means of boosting local employment, interventions to improve labour market matching are generally more effective than investments in human capital, at least in the short term.

Pathways to work

At its heart is an Integrated Pathway for getting people into work. The model is thoroughly researched and developed in part 5, Recommendations for Change and Short Term Action Plan, going way beyond the orthodox brokerage role of Job Centre Plus. The four stages are (1) engagement (with those distant from the labour market) (2) empowering (removing barriers) (3) equipping (with training, skills and qualifications) and (4) Enabling (supporting people into work and at work). The programme requires the strategic involvement of all key agencies and for delivery, coordination between community champions, key workers and service providers. (figure 19)

Strategic Intervention

In 2008 North East Lincolnshire secured £13.2 million from the government’s Working Neighbourhoods Fund to address the problems faced by people getting into full-time sustainable work. A big conference in January 2009 launched a strategic response from the Council and Local Strategic partnership which addresses the key issue of labour market matching. According to Andrea Fitzgerald, the Council’s Community Investment Manager, the model endorsed by Strengthening Economic Well-Being in North East Lincolnshire, has both ‘supply, which is client-focused looking at an individual’s needs, and demand, which looks at creating careers and working with our employers.’ For now the strategy addresses the key problem of labour market matching.

Focus on East Marsh

According to Colin Bulger, Assistant Chief Executive of NELC, ‘Two Community Collaboratives will be set up in the borough’s most deprived areas; East Marsh and South Wards’ supported by local councillor Steve Beasant, Portfolio Holder for Communities and Neighbourhoods. This inter-agency approach builds on the success of Shoreline Housing Association and the NHS in creating intermediate labour markets for residents of deprived areas. Employability programmes operating in Northern Lincolnshire and Goole Hospitals NHS Trust (Grimsby hospital) and more recently in the Care Trust Plus, have delivered a combined total of 325 work placements in jobs such as administrative assistant, receptionist, nursing assistant and service desk analyst. 101 of these trainees have already secured jobs in the NHS and another 46 elsewhere.

**Key message 1:** High levels of deprivation in East Marsh help explain below average performance of local schools

**Key message 2:** Sure Start and the Healthy Schools programme promote health and life skills, aiming to improve social and economic well-being in adults

---

**Investment and impact**

In March 2009 Havelock Academy unveiled plans to invest £22m in rebuilding their local secondary school. Expectations are that a better school environment, and indeed better teaching in all the schools serving East Marsh, will improve school performance.

There is much to do. On orthodox measures of attainment, target driven by central government, East Marsh schools are below the national average. Though the School Profile for Weelsby Primary School, located at the heart of the NRA, shows an exceptionally high 91% of pupils achieving level 2 in science (national average 88%) only 63% achieved level 4 for English (81%) and 72% for maths (78%). Only 27% of pupils at Havelock Academy achieved 5 GCSEs (A*-C) compared with 65% nationally.

---

**Adding value**

Evidence points to a child’s background influencing educational performance. Socioeconomic context compared with the ‘school effect’ has been intensely debated, leading to the contested concept of ‘Contextual Added Value.’¹ No doubt deprivation in East Marsh compromises a child’s capacity to achieve good qualifications. Poor parental qualifications (Table U) are an influence.

A difficult family life often leads to health and behaviour problems, classified as special educational needs (SEN) affecting nearly half the pupils attending Weelsby Primary and over a third attending Havelock. Despite these handicaps, the official CVA formula shows Weelsby adding value significantly above the national average. The level 2 CVA of 986.9 for Havelock Academy puts it within the lowest quartile for mainstream secondary schools.

---

**Economic impact**

National evidence points to qualifications having a major impact on employment prospects and income.² Figure 22 shows this correlation in East Marsh. Residents in part or full time work are much more likely to be qualified than those looking for work, on Incapacity Benefit or looking after the home.

---

Education

Health and education

Education is influenced by and influences health and well-being. This reciprocal relationship influences the early years of child's development. Often it is beneficial. In deprived areas such as East Marsh it can reinforce a downward spiral where physical or mental health problems inhibit educational development. Without intervention by parents or professionals, infant children with these special needs may become school children classified with Special Educational Needs, less likely to attain formal qualifications. 1

Sure Start

Two educational projects in East Marsh aim to improve health, leading eventually to employment and economic well-being, one of the government's 5 national outcomes for children. (Figure 23). Sure Start Local Programmes (SSLPs) were established nationally in successive waves from 1999 to provide integrated support to young children and families living in England’s most disadvantaged communities. Healthcare was one of five core services which SSLPs were required to deliver alongside outreach and home visiting, special needs, family support, childcare and early learning and play. 2

The East Marsh Children’s Centre grew out of East Marsh Sure Start which started in 2001, moving to Victor Street in 2004.

The Centre has an integrated multi-agency staff team. Play, family support and education are complemented by a health team of health visitors, midwives, a nursery nurse, nutritionist and support workers. The Centre gives support to parents with primary and community health and social care. Children’s Nurse Practitioner service provides families with better access to health advice for their children including diagnosis of illness and prescriptions. 3

Life skills

Besides formal qualifications, children’s social skills determine education, earnings and health in adult life. 2 Early interventions by Sure Start and nursery education help children get a better start in life. For older children, ‘Health and Social Education’ is one of five areas of interaction for Havelock Academy and the expanding Shalom Youth Project helps with socialising at-risk children to enable them to become functioning adults. 3

Healthy schools

The concept of a ‘Healthy School’ was adopted by the UK Government in 1999. 4 The rationale is to encourage children into healthy lifestyles, leading to better educational performance in the short term. In the medium term healthier lifestyles will reduce levels of disability, increase employment rates and economic well-being. In the long term, these interventions in early life course will limit levels of disability in later life. 5

Supported by a dedicated NELC team, local schools have adopted the four components of the National Healthy Schools Programme:

- Personal, Social and Health Education
- Healthy Eating
- Physical Activity
- Emotional Health & Well-being

Havelock Academy achieved National Healthy Schools Status in July 2008. In his Healthy School Audit Report (April 2009) Matt Sinclair, Director of Co-curriculum, highlights the contribution of external agencies in achieving Personal Social & Health Education objectives; the Multi Agency Sexual Health Team and the £100,000 project partnership with the NHS to support East Marsh students. A Whole School Food Policy promotes healthy eating at home and has increased take-up of healthy school meals. Obligatory physical exercise is supplemented by co-curricular club activity; a travel plan encourages cycling and walking to school. A school resource team draws in expertise from many external agencies to support individual development plans for pupils with special educational needs.

---

**Environment**

**Key message:** Past programmes and future plans for East Marsh recognise that investment in the environment has a significant impact on the housing market, residents’ security and their health.

Besides improving the appearance of a neighbourhood, investment in the environment makes a significant impact in four other domains (figure 24). Whereas industrial and transport related pollution deters house buyers and damages the health of established residents, a quality environment raises the market value of the housing stock and attracts inward investment in industry and commerce.

Whereas the broken window theory suggests that neglect of the built environment encourages vandalism and feelings of insecurity, Secured by Design investment in a neighbourhood’s built environment improves security and feelings of safety. Safe and secure parks encourage exercise and promote physiological health. Uplifting green spaces restore psychological health.

**Resident’s viewpoint**

The high density grid iron streets of East Marsh provide little open space; few play areas and only two small parks. However, on balance more people in our resident survey were satisfied with these open spaces than dissatisfied (figure 25) even if they had children. Despite road calming measures, more people were dissatisfied with traffic noise, pollution and safety.

The biggest concern was with street appearance with 60% of respondents expressing dissatisfaction with pavements, front gardens, walls, fences and litter. Defying gravity, with low aspirations or commendable resilience, some residents of Guildford Street, part boarded up and awaiting demolition, were fairly satisfied with their environment.

**Plans**

The Designation of East Marsh Neighbourhood Renewal Area brings in its train £210,000 allocated by NELC for environmental improvements. Priorities are determined by local residents and their representatives in the local community forum, East Marsh Involve. Of the 10 priorities agreed at their meeting in March 2009, four related specifically to street appearance. Grants would be ‘offered to local residents to tidy up the front and rear of their houses.’ Funding would be ‘offered to repair and provide boundary walls where necessary as many were in an unsafe state.’ It was planned to identify derelict land and bring it back to use. Flower schemes would enhance street appearance.

Acutely conscious of the link between environment and security, the meeting resolved to extend the system of alley gates behind terraced housing. Four schemes had been undertaken over the past three years to stop of access to strangers. New proposals would acknowledge the need for repair and maintenance and incorporate recycling facilities.

---

Secure alleys

Our resident survey reveals a majority of residents fearing for their safety if out alone in the neighbourhood at night (Section 7). Often they do not venture out in the evening. We have evidence of significant links, first between this fear of crime and stress and second between stress and anxiety or depression. Investment to increase social capital — trust in neighbours, mutual support through Neighbourhood Watch (and there are schemes in East Marsh) or even Sure Start is one option for reducing crime and the fear of crime on the streets.

Another option is ‘target hardening’ — changing the physical environment to make streets less intimidating and homes more difficult to burgle (figure 26). Gating back alleys is probably the most cost-effective investment when the streets themselves cannot be altered. The four schemes implemented over the past three years have been jointly funded by Shoreline Housing Partnership, the social housing provider and NEL Safer Communities Partnership.

Oasis Garden

At the intersection of densely populated Weelsby and Wellington Streets is Your Place, a Christian community centre. Behind their building complex is the Oasis garden. Says garden volunteer Ann Hodgson, it has been created over the past three years to include flower beds, a vegetable plot, fruit bushes and a children’s playground. Within a secure perimeter it provides a tranquil setting for local residents’ spiritual (or, as doctors say) ‘psychological’ restoration.

Grant Thorold Park

Refurbishment of historic Grant Thorold Park at the heart of East Marsh NRA classically illustrates the complex dynamic between different domains. Started in 2004 with resources from the Government’s Liveability Fund, priorities were determined by a newly established Friends of Grant Thorold Park, drawing in local residents (including young people) police representatives, Shoreline and local councillors. According to environmental management officer, Sue Pearson, security considerations were paramount, leading to improved lighting, lowering of bushes to improve sightlines and drop down bollards at the Park’s entrances to prevent car dumping. These measures have led in turn to increased uptake of the three new play areas for toddlers, juniors and teens. Three local football teams play regularly on the refurbished multi-use games area, improving fitness and health, reducing anti-social behaviour.

Sutherland Park

Located at the intersection of Victor Street and Cleethorpes Road (top left of the map on page 5) this is the site of the next major investment in green space. A £10,000 grant has been given to the Podium Project — a local gardening group — by the Big Lottery Breathing Spaces programme. Residents came up with the idea to create a woodland park and were supported in their bid by Claire Wollington, regeneration officer of Shoreline. The plan is to create a woodland park by crowning all the trees, installing bird boxes and planting over 50,000 spring bulbs. The photograph shows local schoolchildren making a start.
The World Health Organization (WHO) maintains health is a goal of all societies — ‘complete physical, mental and social well-being, not merely the absence of disease and infirmity.’1 Adopted by the UK government and elaborated in Our Healthier Nation,2 the priority now is reducing health inequalities3 via those local ‘spearhead’ authorities with the unhealthiest populations. NEL is one of these and East Marsh ward, ranking in the worst 1% in England on the IMD health domain, is a special target for intervention.

### Lifestyles

The National Health Service has a critical role in improving health though the great majority of NHS expenditure is on treating illness in hospitals. Operating in NEL as Care Trust Plus (CTP), the NHS is committed to primary and secondary prevention, often (as emphasised in the governments White Paper, Choosing Health4) improving lifestyles and the risks created by obesity, lack of exercise, irresponsible sex and drug misuse. The management of long term heart disease and cancer has resulted in significant reductions in premature mortality, though the jury is out on whether the gap between East Marsh (the worst ward for CHD) and NEL is closing.

### Wider determinants

The pioneering CTP partnership between the NHS and local authority makes a very strong commitment to tackling the wider determinants of health shown in figure 27. According to chief executive Jane Lewington5 “we needed to do something to break into those economic and social issues, above and beyond our healthier lifestyle work… With public health expertise sitting in the town hall, the local authority can now begin to incorporate health improvement into its housing, environmental, educational, transport and economic planning departments.” Policies and programmes to improve population health are embedded in the CTP five year strategy — Building a Healthy Community Together6 — and the NEL three year Council Plan.7

### Up and downstream investment

The CTP approach is based on a social model of health (Figure 28) adopted by WHO and the UK Government and endorsed by Director of Public Health, Tony Hill.8 According to a Chief Medical Officer for England, Reducing health inequalities requires ‘a broad front approach which reflects scientific evidence that health inequalities are the outcome of causal chains which run back into and from the basic structure of society … Policies need to be upstream and downstream.’9 In an era of tight budgets a key, and largely unresolved question, is how to pinpoint the most cost effective mix of downstream interventions on lifestyle or upstream investments in wider determinants. For East Marsh this is complicated by a population dynamic which attracts unhealthy and low income incomers and exports healthier and aspirational residents with higher incomes.

---

5 Health Services Journal 7th July 2008.
Cementing the relationship between NELC and the NHS, a Strategic Agreement summarised cross-budget flows: £1.19 million from the CTP to the local authority for preventive measures, a contribution of £20.7 million from the local authority to the CTP for providing most aspects of social care.

**Physical health**

These strategic budget flows are both sides of a coin. WHO shows that early life course intervention will in later life prevent disease, disability and dependency on social services (figure 29). Then older people are more likely to be a resource to society, as carers and volunteers, contributing informally to the economy. Using a formula adopted by Leeds University the value of informal care in North East Lincolnshire is circa £100 million a year.

Scientific evidence tends to support primary rather than secondary prevention as making a bigger impact. Naturally there is a compelling case for managing long term conditions such as heart disease and cancer, but early interventions may be more effective in reducing risk and increasing quality of life both in working age adults and older people.

This is the rationale behind ‘lifestyle’ related initiatives undertaken by CTP and partners. Many are focused on deprived areas like East Marsh. For example a team of 15 Health Trainers recruited from these local communities provides one to one support for local people to adopt healthy lifestyles, focusing on diet, exercise and smoking. HeartWell provides funding for community groups to address Cardiovascular Disease and WalkWell encourages local guided walks to improve fitness and reduce risk. An Older People’s Collaborative in East Marsh also addresses psychosocial aspects of health by enabling circa 50 residents find a more active social life.

**Mental health**

Health makes a major contribution to economic performance. Conversely in East Marsh, poor health, especially poor mental health, restricts employment and is a focus of Department of Work and Pensions (DWP) reforms. Mental health problems account for an increasing proportion of the nation’s working age population on Incapacity Benefit over the past decade, reaching 46% in East Marsh (figure 30) during 2008.

---

Security

Key message 1: East Marsh NRA has persistently high levels of crime and disorder which damage the health and well-being of residents

Key message 2: Working through the Community Safety Partnership, Humberside Police have pinpointed the pattern of crime and have a lead role in improving safety and security

The headline statistic is that one of seven sub-areas of the East Marsh NRA is the worst for crime in the whole of England. It is ranked first of 32,842 sub-areas on the crime dimension of the Index of Multiple Deprivation. Other sub-areas in East Marsh also perform badly.

Crime and disorder

Though primary responsibility for security rests with ‘A’ Division of Humberside Police (covering North East Lincolnshire) it is widely recognised that broader social and economic factors influence the level of crime in every locality. It is no coincidence that NEL and East Marsh in particular, rank high on nearly every other domain of deprivation. For this reason the Government monitors local crime statistics by comparison with a family of authorities with similar socioeconomic characteristics.

Preceding sections of this report have highlighted how these socioeconomic determinants exert a dynamic influence (figure 31). The response in NEL (as nationally) is a statutory 1 broad based Community Safety Partnership of agencies, each with some responsibility for addressing these ‘upstream’ causes of crime and disorder. The core partners – Police, Local authority and Care Trust Plus (NHS) have powers and resources to lead on the effort to reduce crime and disorder.

Impact

A neighbourhood’s reputation for crime will influence house prices and residents’ perceived levels of safety inside and outside their homes will influence their health. Crime levels have been high in East Marsh and house prices low. Compared to the national average, many people feel unsafe, in their homes and especially out at night (figure 32). Our representative sample of 223 residents felt either a bit unsafe (32.6%) or very unsafe (6.5%) in their homes alone at night compared with the British averages of 5.4% and 1.0%. They felt either a bit unsafe (40.5%) or very unsafe (30.0%) out alone in the neighbourhood after dark, compared with the British average of 21.5% and 9.8% respectively.

Figure 31: Impact of security

Figure 32: Feelings of safety

Analysis of the British Crime Survey 2 suggests this may be one cause of the relatively large numbers of East Marsh residents with mental health problems. Neighbourhood disorder may also help explain, via stress, the high levels of Coronary Heart Disease in the community. 3

1 Established via section five of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. Suttor members in NEL are Humberside Police (A Division) Humberside Police Authority, NEL Council, Humberside Fire and Rescue Authority, NEL Care Trust Plus.


Improving safety and security is a top priority for the NEL Local Strategic Partnership. The partnership’s high level Local Area Agreement (LAA2) with central government secures funds to meet demanding targets for reducing crime and disorder. The challenges are immense. Though significant reductions were achieved between the baseline year of 2003/4 and 2007/8, these are now less marked. Burglary and certain forms of violent crime persist at high levels. Overall, NEL ranks worst in the family of 15 other local authority areas with similar socio-economic characteristics.¹

**East Marsh hot spot**

The hotspot map shows the East Marsh NRA (outlined) making a significant contribution to overall crime levels in NEL alongside the town centre. East Marsh NRA is the hottest spot for domestic burglary with more than twice the rate (5.2 per 100 households) of the average for North East Lincolnshire and accounting for more than 10% all domestic burglaries in the local authority area. Figure 33 points to a slight increase in burglary though locally high levels of violence and criminal damage appear to be subsiding.²

**Action on wider determinants**

Previous sections of this report highlight the wider determinants of crime in East Marsh and actions — especially in the housing and environment sectors — to improve security and feelings of safety. Enhanced programmes of target hardening should reduce domestic burglary, though the police report many intruders enter homes through open windows and doors. Secured by Design principles applied to the refurbishment of local green spaces should reduce the opportunity for antisocial behaviour.³

Wider socio-economic deprivation is highly correlated with criminality, antisocial behaviour and drug use. Two-thirds of respondents to our community survey saw it as a very (44%) or fairly (24%) big problem and it was a top priority for the residents attending focus groups to prepare the East Marsh (Grant Thorold) Neighbourhood Investment Plan. It was estimated that there were 1300 problem drug users in the local area, many also engaged in crime to supply their addiction. A Drug and Alcohol Action Team (DAAT) has a significant role in East Marsh, engaged in prevention, treatment and rehabilitation.

**Policing Infrastructure**

The 1998 Criminal Justice Act encourages police forces to prevent crime as well as bring offenders to justice. There can be a tension between these roles. Criticised by central government for low detection rates, Humberside Police switched their priorities away from (preventive) community policing. Now prevention is once again a priority. Operating from a modern police station in Hamilton Street, three Police Constables supported by 8 Community Support Officers are a force in the East Marsh Community. They work alongside 4 community wardens managed by NELC, whose remit also covers the safety and security of the East Marsh environment.

---

¹ Humberside Police (2009) Joint Strategic Intelligence Assessment Safer Communities, North East Lincolnshire.
² Humberside Police (2009) Special analysis.
Summary and way forward

Key message 1: Grimsby’s East Marsh Neighbourhood has been caught in a vicious cycle of decline for 30 years

Key message 2: Designation of a Neighbourhood Renewal Area creates an opportunity for optimizing investment to enhance the social and economic life of East Marsh residents

North East Lincolnshire Council has designated a Neighbourhood Renewal Area in Grimsby’s East Marsh ward which takes a more holistic approach to regeneration than has become the norm in England. Besides housing improvement, NELC and partners are investing in economic, educational, environmental, health and social aspects of community life to encourage sustainable development.

Building on the cutting-edge Integrated Impact Assessment pioneered by NELC, our report first identifies the challenges posed by this very deprived neighbourhood and second how the problems in every one of the key domains has a negative impact on other domains. Third, we summarise how investment in each domains (housing for example) has the potential to impact positively on another domain (such as health). This potential has not materialised. So fourth, we conclude by recommending how, in the current economic downturn, a sharper focus on cost-benefit analysis across all sectors would guide decision-makers towards the optimal mix of investments to maximise impact.

Challenges

We report an impressive family of partnerships in North East Lincolnshire, from the overarching Local Strategic Partnership to those focusing on one aspect of community life in East Marsh. We reference many reports which identify problems and solutions. Declaration of a Neighbourhood Renewal Area is the latest in a long line of initiatives.

Yet it is evident that the ebb tide has not yet turned. Despite special programmes run by NELC and partners in addition to mainstream investment, East Marsh remains on a downward trajectory. All sections of our report add to the official neighbourhood profile of a very deprived community. The housing section reveals over 40% of the housing stock is below Decent Homes standard. The economy section reports the proportion of residents unemployed or on Incapacity Benefit is way above the national average.

Our own survey shows the proportion of East Marsh residents without qualifications is three times the national average. Residents also report great dissatisfaction with their living environment. NHS statistics show East Marsh as the worst performing NEL ward for coronary heart disease and according to the Government Department for Work and Pensions, there are big mental health problems. Finally, police statistics show East Marsh has the worst crime record in the whole of North East Lincolnshire.

Vicious cycle of decline

The dynamic accounting model which introduces our report (and each of the sections) can be turned on its head to reveal a vicious cycle of decline which has characterised East Marsh since the collapse of the fish catching industry 30 years ago. Poor employment prospects have led to the out-migration of skilled workers and their replacement by poorer, less healthy incomers. Poor housing conditions have exacerbated health problems and encouraged crime. Residents with few or no qualifications are more likely to be unemployed. Poor health has damaged employment prospects and reduced income. Crime and fear of crime have damaged health, especially mental health, leading to higher levels of unemployment.
Priorities

Our Integrated Impact Assessment reveals a complex economic and social dynamic in Grimsby’s East Marsh. Every aspect of community life is connected to others. Every significant problem creates waves. Every local investment, every project or programme, has the potential to make a positive impact on residents’ lives. We recommend policy makers utilize the IIA protocol to comprehend the wider significance of their actions and strengthen their partnerships.

Policy makers and decision takers cannot do everything at once. There are limits to staff resources. Budget constraints are set to tighten. So there must be priorities. It is not within our remit to suggest detailed policy programmes. Our research does however provide evidence and analysis to help policy makers and the community chart a way forward.

Boosting employment

A priority is to boost employment by coordinating policy interventions. For most adults of working age, paid employment is the only sustainable source of material prosperity. Our neighbourhood profile shows employment and income strongly correlated with good health, skills and qualifications, described by economists as human capital. The relationship means that an area cannot enjoy high rates of employment and wage income without high levels of human capital. It is one of four neighbourhood assets essential to the well-being of a neighbourhood (figure 35). We commend the strategy ‘Strengthening Economic Well-being in North East Lincolnshire’ as applied to East Marsh.

Creating a virtuous circle

National and international evidence suggests that cause and effect run both ways between some domains, such as health and economy. Healthier residents are less likely to be jobless and higher paid when in employment. In turn, employment leads to greater material prosperity and improves health. We recommend sustained effort to create this “multiplier” effect, converting the vicious cycle of decline into a virtuous circle of improvement.

Cost-effective interventions

A squeeze on public spending puts a greater premium on cost-effective interventions. Most investments do some good but some deliver more benefit per pound than others. Local and national evidence on cost effectiveness is not extensive but it does point to:

- Housing investment in security and target hardening as a means of reducing anxiety caused by domestic burglaries and thus of improving health and labour market performance
- Cognitive behaviour therapy as a means of reducing joblessness caused by anxiety
- Investment in so-called “soft” labour market skills — such as motivation, and the personal and social skills involved in effective job search.

On the housing front, tighter regulation of slum landlords and investment in social housing will help resolve the paradox of rising house prices and deteriorating housing conditions.
